UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

Comparative Law Theory

Course Materials

Professor Valcke

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Winter 2011

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
DEC 15 2010
FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

Comparative Law Theory

Course Materials

Professor Valcke

Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Winter 2011

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/comparativelawth00valc_1

Comparative Law Theory

Professor Valcke
Winter 2011

I. Different Kinds of Comparative Law Scholarship

Stefan Vogenauer, "Sources of Law and Legal Method in Comparative Law" in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann, *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law* 869 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) at 875-876.....1

Colleen M. Flood, *International Health Care Reform* (London: Routledge, 2000) at 9, 11, 103-109.....3

George P. Fletcher, *The Grammar of Criminal Law* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007) at 19-20, 68, 221-224, 340-342.....7

James Gordley, ed., *The Enforceability of Promises in European Contract Law* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001) at 267-278.....14

Rosemary J. Coombe, "The Cultural Life of Things: Anthropological Approaches to Law and Society in Conditions of Globalization" 10 Am. J. Int'l L. & Pol'y 791 (1995) at 796-797, 812-818.....21

Konrad Zweigert and Heinz Kötz, *An Introduction to Comparative Law*, 3rd ed., vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998) at 63-67.....30

Tom Ginsburg, "Studying Japanese Law Because It's There" 58 Am. J. Comp. L. 15 (2010) at 15-16, 23-5.....33

Questions I.....38

II. The "Malaise" of Comparative Law

Alan Watson, *Legal Transplants: An Approach to Comparative Law*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1974) at 10-13.....39

Günter Frankenberg, "Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law" 26 Harv. Int'l. L. J. 411 (1985) at 416-426.....41

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa L. Rev. at 1961-1965. 52

Note.....57

Gary King et al, *Designing Social Inquiry—Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994) at 3-12.....58

Questions II.....68

III. Legal Transplants and Legal Formants

Alan Watson, *Legal Transplants: An Approach to Comparative Law*, 2nd ed. (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1974) at 1-9, 21-24, 27-30, 65-70.....69

P. Legrand, "The Impossibility of 'Legal Transplants'" 4 Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law 111 (1997). 83

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment I of II)" 39 Am. J. Comp. L. 1 (1991) at 21-26.....91

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment II of II)" 39 Am. J. Comp. L. 343 (1991) at 384-388.....98

Questions III.....104

IV. Functionalism

Konrad Zweigert and Heinz Kötz, *An Introduction to Comparative Law*, 3rd ed., vol. 1 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998) at 28-45.....105

Konrad Zweigert, "Ends and Means Compared" in Volkmar Gessner et al, eds., *European Legal Cultures* (Dartmouth Publishing, 1996) at 160-164.....114

Geoffrey Samuel, "Epistemology and Comparative Law: Contributions from the Sciences and Social Sciences" in Mark van Hoecke, ed., *Epistemology and Methodology of Comparative Law* (Portland: Hart Publishing, 2004) at 38-43.....117

Jaako Husa, "Farewell to Functionalism of Methodological Tolerance?" 67 RabelsZ 419 (2003) at 421-422, 423-434.....120

Questions IV.....128

V. Comparative Jurisprudence

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa L. Rev. at 1889-1898, 1943-1961, 2104-2149.....129

Questions V.....203

VI. The Internal Standpoint

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986) at 12-15, 62-64.....204

Pierre Legrand, "European Legal Systems Are Not Converging" (1996) 45:1 Int.'l & Comp. L. Q. at 52-81.....208

William Ewald, "The Jurisprudential Approach to Comparative Law: A Field Guide to 'Rats'" (1998) 46:4 Am. J. Comp. L. at 701-704.....238

Questions VI.....242

VII. Law as Diverse yet Unified—Legal Diversity (Many "Legal Systems")

Catherine Valcke, "Comparative Law as Comparative Jurisprudence—The Comparability of Legal Systems" (2004) 52 Am. J. Comp. L. at 720-721.....243

William Ewald, "Comparative Jurisprudence (I): What Was It Like to Try a Rat?" (1994-95) 143 U. Pa L. Rev. at 1957-1958.....245

James Gordley, "The Universalist Heritage" in Pierre Legrand and Roderick Munday, eds., *Comparative Legal Studies: Traditions and Transitions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 31-45.....247

Michel van de Kerchove and Francois Ost, *Legal System between Order and Disorder* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994) at 1-2, 5-28, 102-112, 116-120, 122-146, 170-176.....255

Questions VII.....294

VIII. Law as Diverse yet Unified—Legal Unity (Common Features of Legal Systems)

Lon L. Fuller, *The Morality of Law* (New Haven: Yale Univ. Press, 1969) at 3-4, 33-41, 95-96.....295

Ernest J. Weinrib, "Corrective Justice in a Nutshell" (2002) 52:4 U Toronto L. J. at 349-352, 355-356.....303

Charles Larmore, "Public Reason" in Samuel Freeman, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Rawls* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 368-69, 370-371.....309

Questions VIII.....311

IX. Comparative Methodology

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986) at 65-68.....312

Stefan Vogenauer, "Sources of Law and Legal Method in Comparative Law" in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann, eds., *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law* 869 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008) at 879-885, 886-889.....315

John C. Reitz, "How to Do Comparative Law" 46 Am. J. Comp. L. 617 (1998) at 617-636.....326

Catherine Valcke, "Reflections on Comparative Law Methodology" in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff, eds., *Doing Comparative Law* (forthcoming Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011) (to be handed in class)

Questions IX.....346

X. Epistemological Issues

Rodolfo Sacco, "Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment I of II)" 39 Am. J. Comp. L. 1 (1991) at 10-11.....347

Mitchel de S.-O.-l'E. Lasser, "The Question of Understanding" in Pierre Legrand and Roderick Munday, eds., *Comparative Legal Studies: Traditions and Transitions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003) at 197-239.....349

Günter Frankenberg, "Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law" 26 Harv. Int'l. L. J. 411 (1985) at 411-416.....371

Pierre Legrand, "Comparative Legal Studies and Commitment to Theory" 58 Mod. L. Rev. 262 (1995) at 266-267.....377

Pierre Legrand, "Comparing in Circles", Preface to Pip Nicholson and Sarah Biddulph, *Examining Practice, Interrogating Theory: Comparative Legal Studies in Asia* (Leiden: Brill) (excerpts).....379

Ronald Dworkin, *Law's Empire* (Harvard University Press, 1986), note 15 at 422-423.....383

Questions X.....384

XI. Conclusion

Mathias M. Siems, "The End of Comparative Law" 2 J. of Comp. L. 133 (2007) at 133-150.....385

Questions XI.....403